



CRISIS RECOVERY STRATEGY AND VISITORS PATRONAGE IN THE HOSPITALITY AND TOURISM INDUSTRY (CASE STUDY OF JOS PLATEAU STATE)

ABSTRACT

The hospitality industry in Nigeria has developed over the past years until recently when it witnessed decline due to crisis. Visitors viewed Nigeria and particularly plateau state as a danger zone. Crisis management has received great attention from researchers in recent times, discovering how to deal with tragedies and

DIMFWINA, N. TONGSHINEN¹ AND DR. (MRS) IFEGBO LAWRENCIA²

¹Hospitality Management Department, Federal Polytechnic Bauchi, Bauchi Nigeria. ²Department of Hospitality and Tourism Management, Imo State University, Owerri, Nigeria

Introduction

When crises situations occur, they force hospitality and tourism companies to change their operating strategies. These events generate high levels of uncertainty and usually require quick responses to recover in facing the negative impacts (Boomkamp & Vermolen, 2021). Crisis management is an administrative plan that encompasses steps that help to recognize possible disaster signs. Crisis management has received great attention from researchers in recent times: discovering how to deal with tragedies and cope with crises by preparing in advance, modernizing or inventing new methods of crises management, and learning from experience.



cope with crises by preparing in advance, modernizing or inventing new methods of crises management recovery strategies, and learning from experience. Globally, crises can have significant effects on tourism flows. Whereas studies have discovered several phases of crisis management, this research records an insufficiency of research that embrace the role of crises management recovery strategy on Visitors Patronage in the hospitality and tourism industry as a whole. The objective of this research is to evaluate the role of crisis management recovery strategy, and examine its effect on visitors' patronage in Plateau state, Nigeria. The research methods included a cross-sectional descriptive survey research design utilizing quantitative methods. The research instrument was structured questionnaire for visitors with the help of stratified purposive sampling procedure where 205 questionnaires were administered, 171 were filled and returned which were, physically checked, cleaned, coded, entered into the computer and analyzed. Descriptive statistics were used to measure intervals and tendencies-test/Ordinary least square model was used to respond to the hypothesis, Pearson correlation was used to measure the relationships between the variables while multiple regression analysis was used to reflect all the independent variables in finding out their relationship with the dependent variables. Findings from the study revealed that in profiling the crisis management approaches the mean of human resource approaches was 3.34, marketing was 3.25, and Operational processes had a mean of 3.39 while government assistance was 3.28, the study Furthermore indicated that crisis management recovery strategy had a positive and significant effect on visitors' patronage($r=0.411$, $p=0.000$). Based on this, the study is surely of great concern and importance to scholars, visitors/travellers, inspectors, Government and those planning fresh/new initiatives in the hospitality and tourism industry.

Key Words: Crisis, Management, Recovery Strategy, Hospitality and Tourism, Plateau State



Once the hospitality and tourism industry crises are known this will bring into sharp notice the organization's preparedness, response, mitigation and plan as crisis impact on the reputation of an establishment (Daniels, Minkyung, Laurlyn, & Russell, 2013; Getz, 2008). Crisis can be approached speedily and prevented from escalating to any degree imaginable. Racherla and Clark (2009); AlBattat and Ahmad (2014) supported the view that travel and tourism industry needs to recover with effective recovery strategy and be prepared to overcome the after math or minimize the effects (Rodríguez-Antón & Alonso-Almeida, 2020).

A Study by Israeli, Asad and Bhupesh (2010), shows that the September 11, 2001 terrorist attack on the Twin Towers in the USA, as well as in Europe, the Middle East and the Far East significantly impacted on the travel and tourism industry. According to David, Christopher, Kaufman, Ryan and Valhalla (2011), the hospitality and tourism industry faces constant pressure from an evolving marketplace, which negatively impacts on management and profit margins.

The Hospitality and Tourism Sector Status in Nigeria

Tourism in Africa is a flourishing sector that supports more than 21 million jobs, or 1 in 14 jobs, on the continent. Over the last two decades, Africa has recorded robust growth, with international tourist arrivals and tourism revenues growing 6 per cent per year between 1995 and 2017. In the next decade, tourism's continued growth is expected to generate an additional 11.7 million jobs in Africa (UNWTO, 2020). The Nigerian Tourism sector and the hospitality industry have grown to a significant level from 2004 to 2009 contributing to the economy. In Nigeria, the contribution of tourism to government income from tariffs on tourism sector (registration and other charges) recorded \$0.02m in 2004 and \$1.1m in 2009. Additionally, \$3.45m was generated by corporation tax (National Bureau of Statistics, NBS). In 2011, the industry contributed about \$12.37 billion (3.3 percent) to the GDP in Nigeria (UNWTO, UNWTO World Tourism Barometer, 2021). The report of Risk reinsurance (2015) states that about 16 countries including Nigeria are highly rated as risk countries representing 42% of the region, the report



indicated that 86% of them have civil commotion, strikes as well as unrest crisis and about 80% of the said crisis happened in just Nigeria and Somalia (Reinsurance, 2015). Due to the crisis and other non-state performers in Nigeria, these crises have impacted undesirable effect on the hotels which also have a negative tone on the national economic growth of the country (Adams and Ogbonnaya, 2014; Adebayo and Adebayo, 2015)

The hospitality industry in Nigeria has developed over the past years until recently when it witnessed decline (Esterhuizen & Ensor, 2014). Visitors viewed Nigeria as a danger zone of terrorist attacks on foreign persons and this was fine tuned when a Nigerian (Abdulmutallab) attempted to bomb an American Airline in 2009 (Watch, 2011). According to Maduna and Ensor (2015) previously hotel occupancy in Nigeria was 57.7% in 2010 and 63.7% in 2013 for large hotels while it ranged from 40% to 50% for smaller hotels but the occupancy rate for 2014 dropped drastically to 57.2% and 48.7% in 2015. This scenario became evident due to the travel advisories given by governments of different countries on Nigeria as a highly risk country (Ray, 2016).

Notwithstanding, the locally registered hotels constituted 90% of the hotel accommodation supply in Nigeria (Esterhuizen & Ensor, 2014). According to Eja, Ukwayi, and Ojong (2012) corporate travel constitute 80% of hotel demand in Nigeria while attraction visitors presently account for as low as 5% of most hotel nights. Figure 1.2 describes the effect of crisis on Nigerian hospitality industry especially in 2014 and 2015 where the local hospitality sub-sector came under stress as a result of crisis that badly affected the movement of foreign visitors (Ladan, 2014). In addition, the hospitality business environment became more difficult in 2014 when Boko Haram attacks increased in Northern parts of the country including Abuja and Plateau state (BBC, 2015). According to Adepoju (2014) the issue was complicated with the outbreak of Ebola Virus disease (EVD) in some countries of West Africa including Nigeria and Liberia. Baker (2014) opined that the foreign visitors arrival is related to hotel occupancy in a country; in that a higher foreign visitors' arrival increases hotel occupancy and vis-visa. The hospitality industry in Nigeria lost over US\$0.5bn in revenue as a result



of cancellation of bookings and lack of patronage due to negative advisories (Ojo, et al., 2014). The situation was fairly lessened by the reason that the hotel derives over 65% of its revenue from local visitors (Rohwerder, 2015).

Statement of Problem

It is recognized by Speakman and Richard (2012) that due to the unpredictability of the hospitality and tourism crisis globally, organizations need to be in a position of preparedness to reduce the effect of an occurrence once it happens. According to UNWTO (2007) the necessity for a further tactical approach to threats and crisis management has been established by the current happenings such as the forest fires in Greece, hurricanes in Central America, and the earthquake in Indonesia. While these occasions are encounters to the hospitality segment, they also expose the numerous and kinds of likely natural and artificial crisis which shakes the universe entirely.

Studies show significant academic and practitioner-oriented inquiry related to crisis management actions and plans related to the hospitality industry. Though some scholars such as Albattat *et al.*, (2013), Albattat *et al.*, (2014) have advanced common practices intended to apply to several crisis condition, others as Hartmann (2011), Abegunde (2011), Costa (2012) and Ali, *et al.*, (2012) have focused on the effects of definite crises in the hospitality and tourism industry. Jointly, these studies have reasoned strongly in confirming that strategic policies and procedures are in place as carried out in India, Malaysia, Baghdad, Kenya, and other countries. However, issues have such received less attention in Nigeria (Hai & Abdul, 2011; Ali, *et al.*, 2012; and Kelly, 2013).

The key objective of the Hospitality and tourism policy is to make Nigeria a noticeable destination in Africa, and hence the hospitality industry to generate foreign exchange, boost uniform growth, encourage rural initiatives, create employment, hasten rural-urban amalgamation and nurture socio-cultural harmony among the several zones of the country through the advancement of local and global hospitality (Ekundayo, 2014; Agbebi, 2014). Most of these problems arise as a result of the uncertainty of



crises, which means that only inadequate practices are presented to deal with them (Jaques, 2007). By means of result, there is a sure practice gap within organizations especially the hotel industry that needs to recognize how to design for and react to crises.

Whereas studies have discovered several facets of crisis management, this study noted scantiness of research that embrace the role of crises management on visitors' patronage to the hotels in the hospitality industry. The problem is that crisis and other non-state performers in Plateau State, have impacted undesirable effect on hospitality and tourism patronage (Adams *et al.*, 2014; Adebayo *et al.*, 2015). There is a decrease in numbers of visitors' export and tourist arrivals in Nigeria which eventually translate into their choice, stay and use of any hotel facilities as noted by WTTC (2014) hence the need for this research as a result of crisis situations in Plateau state, Nigeria.

The Specific Objectives of the Study is to;

Determine the crisis management strategy used in influencing visitors' patronage to Plateau State, Nigeria.

Research Hypothesis

H₀₁ Crisis management strategy used does not significantly affect visitors' patronage to Plateau State, Nigeria.

Significance of the Study

The study is important since there is no much research on crisis management recovery strategy on visitors' patronage to the hotels in Nigeria therefore this makes it timely. The study findings will aid the hospitality industry especially the management, in taking crisis management decisions in order to increase patronage to their operations. It will also help the Plateau State Government (Ministry of Tourism and culture) in policy making and implementation of crises management plans and programs that will increase repeat visit in the industry. This study will provide foundation for upcoming research for the academia; it will contribute to informed knowledge in the field of hospitality and tourism.



The study will serve as a marketing strategy for all stakeholders in the hospitality and tourism industry.

Recovery Strategies to Crisis Management

Crisis management recovery strategy have received countless consideration from several scholars in recent times and many came up with diverse approaches related to various formation including that of the hospitality industry (Ahmad, *et al.*, 2013). The literature on crisis management tactics in the hospitality business appears to be comparatively threatened (AlBattat, *et al.*, 2014). Notwithstanding, an inclusive criticism of the literature and discussions with executives will help in collecting a comprehensive list of tactics. Israeli and Reichel (2013) offered the practice of assembling a reliable list of approaches for assessing crisis management, and also Pforr (2006) in a related list to universally known macro level, leisure/ travel industry approaches. These approaches include four subjects: “marketing, infrastructure maintenance, human resources and governmental assistance”. In all of the subjects, approaches applicable to the crisis in the hospitality industry were enumerated. For instance, in the marketing subject, managers proposed that marketing energies desired for government sustenance and tax breaks were modern practices. AlBattat, *et al.*, (2014) in their study concluded that active communication and partnership between Government and non-government organizations are essential to overwhelm and prevent the consequence of any crisis.

Additionally Israeli *et al.*, (2010) pointed that obvious complaints such as protests and strikes, could also advance special consideration from the government. Consequently protest against the government was new in the crisis management approaches. With reverence to maintenance, there should be difference between delay of scheduled beautifying structure repairs and the repairs of less noticeable engineering systems. Scott, Laws, and Prideaux (2009) also added that consideration must be accorded to infrastructure which is the backbone of the hospitality industry and more essential is the marketing approach to be able to change the opinion of the



visitor about the hotel that the premises is not only open but safe for business.

Furthermore, AlBattat *et al.*, (2013) stressed on marketing a hotel existence as a cheap hotel cannot encourage visitors to patronize a risky hotel. According to Marko, Kukanja and Tanja (2013) in the event of crisis, cost reduction as a marketing approach must be used as an important component of the hospitality crisis action, but particular culture as 'drop down of employee's income' and 'decreasing the staff strength' should be carried out with extra care. For the period of short-range crises like that of August 1999 Izmit earthquake in Turkey, or the 1996 Port Arthur carnage, it is suitable to hang up hospitality publicity temporarily and to concentrate on a post-crisis marketing crusade (Uçarkuş, Cakir, & Armijo, 2011). In the individual circumstances, the hospitality establishments really restyled their hospitality selling to encourage the subconscious communication that the crisis had ended (Beirman, 2003).

Crisis Management Models

The Unpredictability of Hospitality and Tourism Crisis Theory

Crisis readiness is well-thought-out by several scholars to be a dynamic component of tourism crisis management. For an organization to be in a position of preparedness, it should be in a capacity of reducing the effect of an occurrence once it happens (Speakman & Richard, 2012). Consequently, planning is a vital element of any contemporary tourism crisis management models, stressing on not only preparation but on staff drill and organizational philosophy or culture (Pfforr, 2006). Precisely, several models propose that hazard valuations must start then, policies ought to be established in agreement using those circumstances that reflect the possibility of occurrences, meanwhile majority of tourism crises are volatile in their manifestation, development and influence (Speakman *et al.*, 2012). The proof of identity of probable or expectable crises is challenging and therefore, situation planning may be costly, time wasting and, eventually, unproductive (Curran, *et al.*, 2013). Definitely, it is proposed that crisis design might result to anxiety and paralysis when an unpredicted incident happens



(Levy, 1994). However, wide-range of crisis, like radical attack, might be foreseen and known procedures should be put in place to address such occasions, signals put forward that safety valuation and circumstances planning may finally be futile given the unpredictable atmosphere of most crises (Boin & Lagadec, 2000; Speakman *et al.*, 2012).

Effects of Crisis Management on Visitors Patronage to Hotels and Tourism Destinations

According to Antonová and Sárka (2014) the impact of several crises presents an equitable need to move on as swiftly as possible, to be able to stay in business as usual. According to Fuchs and Reichel (2010), the threat to the hospitality industry is that the post-crisis can be bigger than during the crisis itself. Visitors to towns are more persuaded to be more afraid with individual protection and safety matters than visitors to countryside or suburban sites, with worthy intentions, as urban sites traditionally have sophisticated rates of criminal activity, (Daniels *et al*, 2013). A major part of the distinctive trials of post crisis recovery can be assumed by probing the motives as to why a traveler service or hotel undergoes loss of business once a crisis happen (Beirman, 2016).

AlBattat *et al.*, (2014) stressed that since travel is typically a flexible activity which visitors select one over another behavior of expenditure of time and money. Assurance needs to be brought back to a level where anticipating visitors trust that commotion has been reduced and their trip venture of time and money is safe. If visitors notice that there is a danger in a destination they are more than likely to make a choice of other hotels (PATA, 2011).

According to Jaque (2007), ‘a good crisis response procedure does not stand for an appropriate crisis management competence. Crisis produced anxiety for visitors and worthlessness to visitors, and likewise in the same way to people approaching them for the first time’. According to Ajayi (2012) a larger percentage of the sampled population in his research “The Socio-economic Impact of Crisis and Militancy on hospitality management in Niger- Delta” was of the view that there has been an extreme decline in the



movement of local visitors and hospitality business during and instantaneously after the crisis in Niger Delta due to weak crisis response. Ajayi continue to claim that the time while crisis was at its highest in the middle of 2003 and 2006, there was somewhat little patronage of the numerous tourists' spots which translated to low hotel patronage too in that region.

Additionally, Scott *et al.*, (2009) note that five sets of danger issues are related to travel decision; 'war and political instability, health concerns, crime, terrorism, and natural disasters'. They established that, travel experience appeared as the highest important interpreter of travel objectives. Criticizing this, the Travel Industry Association of America's convincing marketing crusade opined that "intentions to visitors in the 12 months following 9-11 were to the risk of family, friends and acquaintances condemned holiday choices (AlBattat *et al.*, 2013). Furthermore, Scott *et al.*, (2009), also acclaimed that recovery advertising should target knowledgeable holidaymakers who would need less devotion to protection and safety matters. Thus, an approach intended to improve visitors' opinions of crisis in an exact area is often a key component in the hospitality industry recovery tactics.

"Visitors go to urban hotels and destinations with good crisis management approaches as the 'features shown by hotels and destinations can raise the perception of visitors as negative in an unfamiliar area' (Daniels *et al.*, (2013). Hotels and destinations with good crisis management are, justly or not, connected with individual risk, and first-class hotel around the globe have been socially built as risky areas (Daniel, *et al.*, 2013). This cataloging is typically dangerous if the hotel is also perceived as ethically unstable and subject to crisis (Fuchs & Reichel, 2010). Reimagining a hotel that is mostly seen as crisis area is no stress-free duty, needing mutually a conceptual move as well as concentrated marketing events over time (Santos, Belhassen & Canton, 2008). Catching the attitudes and view of visitors and people is an important step to recognizing and redesigning views of crisis (George, 2009; Santos *et al.*, 2008).



Methodology

This study embraced the cross-sectional descriptive survey research design based on cross section of information collected from the population in order to determine the role of crisis management in influencing visitors to hotels in Plateau State, Nigeria.

Plateau State is located in the north-central geopolitical zone of Nigeria, created out of the old Benue-Plateau in 1976 with its headquartered in Jos. The state lies between latitudes 9051'30"N to 10002'00"N and longitudes 8048'00"E to 9059'00"E. It has an area of 291km² and a population based on a contemporary approximation from the National Population Commission of 3,206,531- Male: 1,598,998; Female: 1,607,533. (LawNigeria.com). The selection of Plateau state for this study is based on the fact that, Plateau crisis has resulted in unimaginable hostilities, killings, bombings and other forms of violence (Comfort, Imhonopi & Urim, 2013). The area of study is suitable because of the location; it is a tourist destination and is prone to crisis (Abubakar, 2013).

Table 1 Target Population Frame

Establishment	No. Establishment	No. of Visitors	Population
Hotels	52	24,360	24,412
Airport	1	25,062	25,063
Attractions	13	7,032	7,045
Bus Stations	17	25,500	25,500
Total	66	81,954	82,020

Source: Feld Survey (2021)

The formula by Israel (1992) was used to calculate the sample size at 95% confidence level at ±7% precision.

$$n = \frac{N}{1 + N(e)^2}$$

Where n= sample size, N = population size, e = level of precision.

When the formula is used then;



$$n = \frac{82,020}{1 + 82,020(.07)^2} = 205$$

Table 2 Respondents per Category/Response Rate

S/N	Category of Respondents	Number of Respondents	Response Rate	Response Rate %
1	Hotel	121	101	49%
2	Airport	8	7	3%
3	Bus Stations	46	38	19%
4	Attractions	30	25	12%
	Total	205	171	83%

Source: Field survey (2021)

Table 2 shows the total number of the respondents from each of the strata which was used for the study. This data was analysed using descriptive and inferential statistics which measured intervals and tendencies within and between groups.

Results

Table 3 Human Resources as a Recovery Strategy to Crisis Management

Human resource Strategy	Number	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly agree	Mean	Std. Dev.
Reducing the number of employees	171	29.8%	19.3%	15.2%	35.7%	3.6	1.3
Shortening working hours	171	45.0%	19.3%	11.7%	24.0%	3.2	1.2
Lowering personal salary	171	32.2%	22.8%	19.9%	25.1%	3.4	1.2
Reducing the number of permanent employees	171	32.2%	31.0%	18.7%	18.1%	3.2	1.1
Use of part time and outsourcing	171	32.2%	22.2%	21.1%	24.6%	3.4	1.2



Average						3.3	1.2
---------	--	--	--	--	--	------------	------------

Source: Field Survey (2021)

The result from Table 3 presents the average mean score as 3.3 where reducing the number of employees has a mean score of 3.6, lowering personal income 3.4, and use of part time employment and outsourcing 3.4 are regarded as key to human resource management during crisis management.

Implication for this is that hospitality and tourism managers should give recognition to the number of employees in the establishment as a recovery approach to crisis by reducing the number of employees as a strategy, lowering personal income and the use of part time employment and outsourcing as a good approach to crisis management. The human resource development plays an important role in the effectiveness of crisis management and awareness. The application of any plan or approaches to contain or respond to any crisis event is solely in the hands of the employee skill and experience in the handling of such occurrences (Ahmad, *et al.* 2013).

Table 4 Marketing as a Recovery Strategy to Crisis Management

Marketing Strategy	Number	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly agree	Mean	Std Dev
Joint marketing campaigns with business partners	171	45.0%	18.7%	9.4%	26.9%	3.2	1.3
Active advertising in the media	171	45.6%	22.2%	5.8%	26.3%	3.1	1.3
Increasing the number of specific actions (happy hour, etc.)	171	37.4%	30.4%	9.4%	22.8%	3.2	1.2
Price drops	171	39.2%	24.6%	7.6%	28.7%	3.3	1.3
Promoting new products and services	171	36.3%	24.0%	7.6%	32.2%	3.4	1.3



Marketing to new segments	171	31.0%	33.3%	8.2%	27.5%	3.3	1.2
Increasing the number of fixed price menus	171	29.8%	32.2%	14.0%	24.0%	3.3	1.1
Average						3.3	1.2

Source: Field Survey (2021)

Table 4 displays the result of the study for marketing as an approach to crisis management. The marketing approaches must be an essential part of the tourism industry's action in tackling crisis through price drops which has a mean score of 3.3, increasing the number of specific actions like promoting new products and services which has a mean score of 3.4, marketing to new segment which has 3.3 mean score, and increasing the number of fixed price menus which has 3.3 mean score.

This study agrees with the assertion by Marko, *et al.* (2013) that cost reduction, culture of drop down of employees' income and reduction of staff strength should be carried out with extra care. AlBattat *et al.* (2014) emphasized that the influence of marketing is to clear the ambiguity that helps towards visitors changing their behavior in visiting crisis destinations. Scott *et al.* (2009) also stressed that marketing approach is essential in changing the opinion of visitors that patronized a hotel.

Table 5 Operational Processes as a Recovery Approach to Crisis Management

Operational processes	Number	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree	Mean	Std Dev
Cost cuts by limiting restaurant services	17 1	38. 0%	19. 3%	8.2 %	34.5%	3. 4	1. 3
Cost cuts by using cheaper substitutes in the establishment	17 1	48. 5%	19. 3%	8.2 %	24.0%	3. 1	1. 2



Postponing maintenance to the facility	17 1	25. 7%	34. 5%	14. 6%	25.1%	3. 4	1. 1
Postponing scheduled payments	17 1	28. 1%	30. 4%	18. 1%	23.4%	3. 4	1. 1
Average						3. 3	1. 2

Source: Field Survey (2021)

Table 5 shows the study findings of operational process being used as a recovery strategy in crisis management. The result further shows that cost cuts by limiting restaurant services with a mean score of 3.4, postponing maintenance to the facility with a mean score of 3.4, and postponing scheduled payments with a mean score of 3.4 are the major indicators of operational processes during crisis situation in the tourism industry.

This implies that during crisis event, managers should note that postponing scheduled payment, postponing maintenance to the infrastructure and cutting of cost by limiting establishment service are regarded as key to the operational process in the tourism industry. According to Scott *et al.* (2009) infrastructure must be accorded a prime place in the business of tourism since it is the pillar of the industry.

Table 6 Government Assistance as Recovery approach to Crisis Management

Government assistance Strategy	Number	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree	Mean	Std Dev
Organized protest against the tax legislation	171	29.8%	19.3%	26.3%	24.6%	3.5	1.2
Organized protest against labor legislation	171	37.4%	28.1%	19.3%	15.2%	3.1	1.1
Increasing the sector's power by joining tourism	171	36.8%	22.2%	17.5%	23.4%	3.3	1.2



associations, chambers, unions etc							
Average	171					3.3	1.1

Source: Field Survey (2021)

Table 6 presents the findings on Government Assistance as a strategy for crisis recovery. This result indicated that only organized protest against the tax legislation with a mean score of 3.5 is regarded as a means of government assistance to the tourism sector during crisis period, organized protest against labor legislation had a mean score of 3.1 and increasing the sector's power by joining tourism associations, chambers, unions and others scored 3.3.

The implication is that organizations protest against the tax legislation has been discovered as a useful tool to enable the government assist in the hospitality and tourism industry. Contrary to this, AlBattat *et al.* (2014) asserts that an effective communication alongside effective partnership with government and non-governmental organization is important in preventing the consequences of a crisis.

Table 7 Reasons for Patronage in Plateau State

Statements	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly agree	Number	Mean	Std Dev.
The environment	32.7%	5.3%	5.3%	56.7%	171	3.9	1.4
Recommendation by family and friends	49.7%	15.8%	9.9%	24.6%	171	3.1	1.3
Institutional referrals	38.6%	16.4%	7.0%	38.0%	171	3.4	1.3
Prices of product and services	39.8%	18.7%	9.9%	31.6%	171	3.3	1.3
Business Location	35.7%	28.1%	8.8%	27.5%	171	3.3	1.2



The quality of infrastructures	35.1%	25.1%	11.7%	28.1%	171	3.3	1.2
Security and safety	33.3%	26.9%	11.7%	28.1%	171	3.4	1.2
provision of information	36.8%	23.4%	12.3%	27.5%	171	3.3	1.2
Speed of check-in & check-out services	36.3%	28.7%	9.9%	25.1%	171	3.2	1.2
Individual attention and respect	38.0%	22.8%	8.2%	31.0%	171	3.3	1.3
Provision of services according to customers' request	43.9%	24.6%	10.5%	21.1%	171	3.1	1.2
Employees kindness and respect	37.4%	29.2%	7.6%	25.7%	171	3.2	1.3
Word of mouth	28.1%	29.2%	8.2%	34.5%	171	3.5	1.2
Average					171	3.3	1.2

Source: Field Survey (2021)

The findings from Table 7 shows an average mean score of 3.3 that visitors' reasons for patronizing Plateau State were the environment with a mean score of 3.9, institutional referral 3.4 mean score, the price of products and services with 3.3 mean score, the quality of infrastructures with 3.3 mean score, security and safety with 3.4 mean score, the provision of information with 3.3 mean score, the individual attention and respect given to visitors with 3.3 mean score and word of mouth from visitors with 3.5 mean score. This means that visitors to Plateau State have their various reasons for patronizing the products and Plateau State as a destination.

This result agrees with the findings of Asadifard *et al.* (2015) that factors affecting patronage are clustered like product pertinent factors which include product features and attributes. Additionally, it further agrees with; Ibumilua (2009) that attractive sights and environment generate recurrent patronage. The appearance of the structures at a destination image plays a



great role in the choice procedure of a visitor (Moreira *et al.*, 2014). In this case it is discovered that the surroundings of hotels with good crisis management attract more customers.

Table 8 Correlation Analysis of Crisis management recovery strategies

		Visitors' patronage	Crisis management recovery strategy
Visitors' patronage	Pearson Correlation	1.000	
	Sig. (2-tailed)		
Crisis management recovery strategy	Pearson Correlation	.474**	1.000
	Sig. (2- tailed)	0.000	
** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).			

Source: Field Survey (2021)

Table 8 shows the result of the relationship between Crisis management recovery strategy and visitors patronage. The results indicated that crisis management recovery strategy and visitors' patronage were positively and significantly associated ($r=0.474$, $p=0.000$).

The result of this study agrees with that of Israeli *et al.* (2010) that using operation process as an approach among other approaches should include; the practice of cost cutting through outsourcing, but when cost of labor is comparatively low during crisis in hotel, reducing employee or laying them off may not be the most encouraging actions.

According to Baker (2014) the hotel industry must carry out recovery marketing that is fully joined with crisis management actions since marketing is always the first sufferer of any crisis in any destination image therefore marketing is vital. Albabatta *et al.* (2014) reported that the introduction of recovery marketing campaign was to support "Cuti Cuti Malaysia' in convincing domestic visitors. Emir and Kozak (2011) say,



hospitality marketing managers need to consider needs, wants, and the demand of their visitors. Hotel marketing that can track, treat and change the reflective psychology of visitors will be able to price well after post-crisis.

Furthermore, Speakman *et al.* (2012) highlighted that among the many crisis recovery strategies, it is operational processes which gives confidence to staff and visitors in the hotel. These recovery tactics include price reduction vacation; value added special offers and other marketing strategies. Though the appraisal of the use of crisis management approaches suggests that hotel managers' actions are different. Their actions focus on cost cutting, whereas cost cutting is evidently a measure of efficiency and not effectiveness therefore managers must tailor their crisis management value to include measures for successful longtime effectiveness of the hotel (Albattata, *et al.* 2013). According to Israeli *et al.* (2010) these vital actions of managers that is aimed at refining the hotel effectiveness, may be postponed at crisis period to change their attention to refining efficiency.

Table 9 Regression Analysis of Crisis Management Approaches

Variable	B	Std. Error	t	sig
(Constant)	1.395	0.2	6.966	0.000
Crisis management recovery strategy	0.411	0.059	6.994	0.000

Source: Field Survey (2021)

Table 9 is the result of the impact of crisis management recovery strategy on visitors' patronage. The results from table 4.12 (Regression Analysis) indicated that crisis management recovery strategy had a positive and significant effect on visitors' patronage ($r=0.411$, $p=0.000$). This means that a unitary increase in crisis management recovery strategy, will lead to an increase in visitors' patronage by 0.411 times.

Hypothesis Testing of Crisis management recovery strategy

The hypothesis was tested by using the ordinary least square regression model. The acceptance/rejection criteria was that, if the p value is greater than 0.05, the H_0 is not rejected but if it's less than 0.05, the H_0 is rejected.



The null hypothesis was: Crisis management recovery strategy does not have any significant effect on visitors' patronage in Plateau State, Nigeria. The alternative hypothesis was crisis management approaches have a significant effect on visitors' patronage in Plateau State, Nigeria. The p-value of 0.000 indicated that the null hypothesis was rejected hence crisis management recovery strategy have a significant effect on visitors' patronage in Plateau State, Nigeria.

The implication of this is that managers must make effort to recover from the impact of crisis. According to Ngoc *et al.* (2015) hotel managers should invest time and resource in educating and training the employees in building their skills in the hospitality industry. Albattata *et al.* (2014) pointed out that media has the power to clear certain ambiguity that do help the hotel marketing strategy towards visitors to change their perception and make a repeat patronage. Paraskevas (2013) in his words forwarded that communication and marketing systems are the major networks that are used to restore the hospitality and tourism business image and bring back business to status quo after a crisis event. Hospitality crisis management plan should include the use of operational process in improving the security and safety systems. (Reichel & Israeli, 2003)

In addition, Speakman *et al.* (2012) forwarded that the use of government support strategy by a way of expenses and taxes is recommended during crisis as a recovery strategy when the crisis is external and imposed on the hospitality sector. Hotel managers look for government assistance to bail out the hospitality industry from the effect of the crisis. The inability of the government to assist the hospitality industry and the focus on approaches of efficiency create questions about the capability of the management and government to improve or salvage the industry or secure its effectiveness in times of crisis (Reichel & sraeli, 2003).

Summary and Conclusion

The summary of the study findings are presented in accordance with the study objectives. The result shows that majority of the respondents did not agree that shortening of working hours was a useful strategy in responding to a crisis.

Marketing strategy must be an essential part of the tourism industry action in tackling crisis through cost reduction, price drops, increasing the number of specific actions like promoting new products and services, marketing to new segment and increasing the number of fixed priced menus.



Postponing scheduled payment, postponing maintenance to the infrastructure and cutting of cost by limiting establishment service are regarded as key to the operational process in the tourism establishment. Organization protest against the tax legislation has been discovered as a useful tool to enable the government assist in the tourism industry.

Recommendation

The Plateau State Ministry of Culture and Tourism should have a combined marketing strategy and execution procedure in answering to a crisis and in planning out a reclamation approach to encourage destination consciousness;

There is need to recognize the number of employees in an establishment as an approach to crisis by; reducing the number of employees, lowering personal income, the use of part time employment and outsourcing as a good approach to crisis while also being mindful of staff job performance.

Reference

- Abubakar, M. A. (2013, June 6th). Ethno Religious and political Crisis In Plateau State Nigeria. Jos.
- Adams, D., & Ogbonnaya, U. M. (2014). Ethnic and Regional Violence in Nigeria: Implications for National Security. *Journal of Politics and Law*; Vol. 7, No. 3, pp20-34.
- Adepoju, D. (2014). Impact of Ebola crisis on hospitality and travel in Sub Saharan Africa. *Nigeria: Finance and Investment*.
- Ajayi, A. P. (2012). The Socio-economic Impact of Crisis and Militancy on Tourism Destination management in Niger- Delta. *Asian Journal of Management Science and Education*, 127-140.
- AlBattat, A. R., Ahmad, M. P., & Li-Ting, C. (2014). Hospitality Emergency Management and The Dirty Twelve: A Dozen Reasons for Failure. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Innovation in Hospitality and Tourism*, 89-106.
- AlBattata, A. R., & MatSom, A. P. (2014). Emergency planning and disaster recovery in Malaysian hospitality industry. *5th Asia Euro Conference of Social and Behavioral Sciences* 144, 45-53.
- Baker, D. M. (2014). The Effects of Terrorism on the on the Travel and Tourism Industry. *International Journal of Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage: Vol. 2: Iss. 1, Article 9*, 57-58.
- Beirman, D. (2003). *Restoring Tourism Destinations in Crisis: A strategic marketing approach*. Australia: Allen & Unwin.
- BBC. (2011, August 26). Abuja attack: Car bomb hits Nigeria UN building. Retrieved June 17, 2016, from WWW.BBC.abujacarbombing.com.



- BBC. (2015, November 24). Nigeria Boko Haram: Militants 'Technically Defetted' Buhari, December 2015. Retrieved June 17, 2016, from <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-Africa:35173618>
- BBC. (2016, January 18). Burkina Faso attack: Al-Qaeda 'names' hotel attackers'. Retrieved June 15, 2016, from BBC: http://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-35342908?ocid=socialflow_twitter
- Boomkamp, N. v., & Vermolen, N. (2021). Crisis management: The response of a small Dutch hospitality company during the COVID-19 pandemic. *Research in Hospitality Management is co-published by NISC (Pty) Ltd and Informa UK Limited (trading as Taylor & Francis Group)*, 159-164.
- Comfort, O., Imhonopi, D., & Urim, U. M. (2013). Addressing the Insecurity Challenge in Nigeria: The Imperative of Moral Values and Virtue Ethics. *Global Journal of Human Social Science*, 52-63.
- Daniels, M. J., Minkyung, P., Laurlyn, H. K., & Russell, B. E. (2013). Bridging risk management perceptions and processes: the case of the National Mall and Memorial Parks. *International Journal of Culture, Tourism and Hospitality Research* Vol. 7 Iss 2, pp. 115-117.
- David, V. J., Christopher, D. E., Kaufman, B., Ryan, L., & Valhalla, N. Y. (2011, April 05). Hotel and Hospitality Risk Management. *The Voice of the Defence Bar*, pp. 1-4.
- Eja, E. I., Ukwaiyi, J. K., & Ojong, E. F. (2012). Success Factors Determining Nigeria as a Tourist Destination. *Journal of Emerging Trends in Educational Research and Policy Studies (JETERAPS)* 3(4), 426-432.
- Ekundayo, Y. .. (2014). Strategic Development and Sustainability of Tourism Industry in Nigeria. *Laurea: Laurea University of Applied Sciences*.
- Esterhuizen, J., & Ensor, C. (2014). *Hospitality Outlook: 2014-2018; South Africa – Nigeria – Mauritius–Kenya 4th Edition*. South Africa: PricewaterhouseCoopers Inc.
- Fuchs, G., & Reichel, A. (2010). An exploratory inquiry into destination risk perceptions and risk reduction strategies of first time vs repeat visitors to a highly volatile destination. *Tourism Management* Vol. 32 No. 2, pp. 266-276.
- Gall, C. (2016). *Jihadists Deepen Collaboration in Africa*. New York: New York times .
- George, R. (2009). Visitor perceptions of crime-safety and attitudes towards risk: the case of Table Mountain National Park, Cape Town. *Tourism Management*, Vol. 31 No. 6, pp. 805-815.
- Hai, M. A., & Abdul, C. R. (2011). Political Stability: Country Image for Tourism Industry in Bangladesh. *Proceeding of the International Conference on Social Science, Economics and Art 2011*, 58-65.
- Hartmann, J. (2011). Crisis Management of the Hotel Industry in Finland. *Haaga-Helie University of applied science*, 1-56.
- Israeli, A. A., Asad, M., & Bhupesh, K. (2010). Hospitality crisis management practices: The case of Indian luxury hotels. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 1-8.
- Jaques, T. (2007). Issue Management and Crisis Management: An Integrated, Non-linear, Relational Construct. *Citation: Public Relations Review*, 33(2), pp 147-157.
- Kelly, R. (2013). The terrorist attack on the Westgate Mall in Nairobi, Kenya, in September 2013. New York: US Army.



- Ladan, S. I. (2014). An Analysis of Air Transportation in Nigeria. *JORIND* 10 (2) www.transcampus.org./journals, www.ajol.info/journals/jorind, 230-237.
- Levy, D. (1994). Chaos theory and strategy: Theory, application and managerial implications. *Strategic Management Journal*, 15(Summer), pp.167–178.
- Marko Kukanja, M. S., & Tanja, M. P. (2013). The Response of the Restaurant Industry to the Financial Crisis. *EKON. MISA O PRAKSA DBK. GOD XXII.*, 39-56.
- PATA. (2011). *Bounce Back Tourism Risk, Crisis and Recovery Management Guide*. Bangkok: Bert van Walbeek - The Winning Edg.
- Pforr, C. (2006). Tourism in Post-Crisis is Tourism in Pre-Crisis: A Review of the Literature on Crisis Management in Tourism. *A Review of the Literature on Crisis Management in Tourism, Working Paper Series*, 1-11.
- Racherla, P., & Clark, H. (2009). A Framework for Knowledge-Based Crisis Management in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry. *Cornell Hospitality Quarterly* Volume 50, Issue 4, 561-577.
- Ray, N. (2016). *Growing Threat of Terrorism in Africa: The Case of Boko Haram*. India: Indian Council of World Affairs .
- Reinsurance, R. (2015). *2015 Terrorism & Political Violence Risk Map - a guide*. Aon Risk Solutions.
- Rodríguez-Antón, J., & Alonso-Almeida, M. (2020). COVID-19 Impacts and Recovery Strategies: The Case of the Hospitality Industry in Spain. *Sustainability* 2020, 12, 8599; doi:10.3390/su12208599 www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability, 1-17.
- Rohwerder, B. (2015). Crisis management models in Africa. *GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report* 1199, 1-10.
- Santos, C., Belhassen, Y., & Canton, K. (2008). Reimagining Chinatown: an analysis of tourism. *Tourism Management* Vol. 29 No. 5,, pp. 1002-1012.
- Scott, N., Laws, E., & Prideaux, B. (2009). Tourism Crises and Marketing Recovery Strategies. *Journal of Travel & Tourism Marketing*, 1-13.
- Speakman, M., & Richard, S. (2012). A chaos theory perspective on destination crisis management: Evidence from Mexico. *Journal of Destination Marketing & Management*, 1-11.
- Uçarkuş, G., Cakir, Z., & Armijo, O. (2011). Western Termination of the Mw 7.4, 1999 İzmit Earthquake Rupture: Implications for the Expected Large Earthquake in the Sea of Marmara. *Turkish Journal of Earth Sciences (Turkish J. Earth Sci.)*, Vol. 20,, 379–394.
- UNWTO. (2020). *Implementation of the UNWTO Agenda for Africa 2030: Tourism for inclusive growth*. Madrid, Spain: World Tourism Organization.
- UNWTO. (2021). *UNWTO World Tourism Barometer*. Madrid, Spain: World Tourism Organization.
- Watch, N. (2011). *Third Report on Violence in Nigeria (2006-2011)*. Nigeria : Nigeria Watch.